



CSU  
College of Law Library

---

1992

## Excerpts from Taft Strategic Atlas: U.S. Health Care Reform

Frederick I. Taft

*Spieth, Bell, McCurdy & Newell*

Follow this and additional works at: <https://engagedscholarship.csuohio.edu/jlh>



Part of the [Health Law and Policy Commons](#)

**How does access to this work benefit you? Let us know!**

---

### Recommended Citation

Frederick I. Taft, Excerpts from Taft Strategic Atlas: U.S. Health Care Reform, 7 J.L. & Health 73 (1992-1993)

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the Journals at EngagedScholarship@CSU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal of Law and Health by an authorized editor of EngagedScholarship@CSU. For more information, please contact [library.es@csuohio.edu](mailto:library.es@csuohio.edu).

EXCERPTS FROM TAFT STRATEGIC ATLAS:  
U.S. HEALTH CARE REFORM

FREDERICK I. TAFT

## CAUTIONARY PRINCIPLES

### 1. HEALTH CARE REFORMS SHOULD PRESERVE SUCCESSFUL ASPECTS OF OUR PRESENT SYSTEM.



#### President Bush's Plan

Government regulation of private business should be kept to a minimum in order to allow market forces to work effectively.

#### Heritage Plan

Government health programs such as Medicare and Medicaid should remain largely intact because they function adequately to cover the cost of health care for the elderly and poor.

#### Heritage Plan

Health care reforms should preserve successful aspects of our present system.

#### Pauly Plan

Political feasibility and use of existing systems in health care and government are important factors to consider in reforming the health care delivery system.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

#### Pauly Plan

While the obligation to obtain coverage is on individual citizens, many will choose to satisfy this obligation by continuing with or initiating the purchase of insurance through employment-related groups.

### 2. COMPREHENSIVE HEALTH CARE REFORM MAY NEED TO BE ACHIEVED IN STAGES.



#### American College of Physicians Plan

Comprehensive changes may need to be made gradually, particularly those changes that have significant financial impact.

**3. REFORM OF THE HEALTH CARE SYSTEM SHOULD NOT RAISE THE FEDERAL DEFICIT.**



**Heritage Plan**

Health care reform should be budget neutral and not raise the federal deficit.

**Aaron Plan**

Reform of the health care finance system cannot wait until the federal budget deficit is brought under control, so health care financing reform must raise enough revenue so it causes no increase in the deficit.

**4. FEDERAL LEADERSHIP IN SHAPING THE HEALTH CARE SYSTEM IS APPROPRIATE, BUT THE SYSTEM MUST BE ALLOWED TO ADAPT TO STATE AND LOCAL REALITIES.**



**Hawaii Plan**

Federal leadership in health promotion, cost containment and expanding access to health care is needed, but the states should be given room to experiment and find locally appropriate solutions.

**Oregon Plan**

The health care system must be allowed to adapt to varying local and regional circumstances.

**American Nurses Association Plan**

Shape the delivery system to respond to local needs and realities.

**Catholic Health Association Plan**

No task should be absorbed by a higher, more centralized level of the health care system if that task can be performed adequately at a lower level.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Catholic Health Association Plan**

While the states should define local health care needs, set priorities, and manage competition, the federal government, through an independent public agency, should coordinate and finance the national health care system and guarantee universal access.

**5. AVOID DETAILED REGULATION OF THE PROVIDER-PATIENT RELATIONSHIP.****American Hospital Association Plan**

Health care providers must be given greater freedom to make decisions without micro-management by government payers and insurers in order to focus more energy on patient care and less on administrative details.

**American College of Physicians Plan**

Physicians will accept cost constraints in a reformed health care system if there is an end to the overwhelming regulatory intrusion that currently dominates medical practice.

**American College of Physicians Plan**

There is an appropriate role for regulation at the macro-level, such as governing the supply of health resources, but micro-level regulation of the physician-patient relationship has failed.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Catholic Health Association Plan**

Improve and coordinate health care for individual families and communities by realigning the financial incentives which providers face rather than through a burdensome regulatory structure.

**THE INDIVIDUAL PERSPECTIVE**

**6. CONSUMERS SHOULD BE MADE CONSCIOUS OF HEALTH CARE COSTS AND GIVEN INCENTIVES TO MAKE COST-EFFECTIVE CHOICES ABOUT THEIR CARE.**

**Pauly Plan**

Consumers who are conscious of health care costs will use preventive services more and emergency services less.

**American Nurses Association Plan**

Give consumers incentives and the means to be cost-conscious about health care and actively involved in their own health care decisions.

**American Hospital Association Plan**

Because most consumers have insurance and do not pay directly for the cost of health care, they have little incentive to conserve their use of health care resources, compare potential benefits to cost, or shop for the most cost-effective providers.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Conservative Democratic Forum Plan**

Basic health insurance policies should require copayments to make consumers cost-conscious.

**7. AMERICANS VALUE HIGHLY THE OPPORTUNITY TO MAKE CHOICES ABOUT THE KIND OF HEALTH CARE THEY WILL RECEIVE.**



**Heritage Plan**

Changes in the health care system should maximize the opportunity for individuals to make choices about the kind of health care they will receive.

**Heritage Plan**

The success of the "consumer choice" health benefits program which covers over nine million federal government workers indicates that American consumers will be capable of making sound choices on health insurance plans if they are provided with adequate information.

**Reinhardt Plan**

Some tiering of the quality of health care services by income class is inherent in such ideas as consumer choice and managed competition.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Reinhardt Plan**

Assure low income individuals a basic comprehensive health care benefit package, but allow higher-income groups to enroll in more comprehensive plans.

**American Hospital Association Plan**

The freedom of individuals to choose a primary caregiver supports a traditional American value and ensures a convenient point of entry into the health care system.

**Jackson Hole Group Plan**

The freedom to choose health care providers and bargain for health insurance is important to consumers and ingrained in the American health care delivery system.

**American Association of Retired Persons Plan**

Cost containment efforts should not unreasonably limit a patient's choice of health care provider, because the freedom to make choices regarding one's health care provider is a valued element of our present system.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Catholic Health Association Plan**

Health care consumers and individual providers must have meaningful opportunities to participate in the shaping and governance of the health care system.

**McDermott/Wellstone Plan**

Each individual should be free to choose among independent practitioners or to enroll in a managed care plan.

**8. PRIMARY CARE SHOULD BE AVAILABLE IN ACCESSIBLE, FRIENDLY SETTINGS TO LOWER BARRIERS TO TIMELY CARE.**



**American Nurses Association Plan**

Deliver primary health care in community-based settings, such as schools, work sites and community health centers.

**American Hospital Association Plan**

Health care is a local concern because people generally seek medical care and develop relationships with primary care providers in their own community.

**American Hospital Association Plan**

Individuals must be encouraged to obtain care when they need it and in an appropriate health care setting.

[CONTINUED]

[CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE]

**American Association of Retired Persons Plan**

Easy access to health care will encourage individuals to use needed services, especially primary and preventive services such as maternal and child health care, immunizations, and screening programs.



**9. MORE ATTENTION AND RESOURCES NEED  
TO BE DEVOTED TO WELLNESS  
PROMOTION AND PREVENTIVE CARE.**



**American Nurses Association Plan**

Focus the health care system on wellness promotion, especially for women and children.

**American Hospital Association Plan**

The basic health benefits package should emphasize preventive services, such as health education and screening for early detection of disease.

**10. EVERYONE SHOULD HAVE BASIC HEALTH  
INSURANCE COVERAGE.**



**President Bush's Plan**

The health care insurance market must be restructured to achieve portability, wide access, and renewable coverage for all citizens.

**Pauly Plan**

Health care is a service which the nonpoor in the community are concerned about providing to the poor.

**Reinhardt Plan**

U.S. health care reform should achieve universal coverage, portable health insurance, simplicity and administrative cost control.

**Reinhardt Plan**

All taxpayers should pay a small tax to help finance health insurance for the poor.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Clinton Plan**

Provide all Americans affordable access to high quality health care.

**Shortell Plan**

In addition to cost containment, health care reform must address unmet health care needs and quality of service rendered.

**American College of Physicians Plan**

All persons living in the United States would through private or public insurance have access to the same benefits - all medically effective and appropriate care.

**Aaron Plan**

The federal government can use its regulatory powers to achieve near universal coverage of working people and their families through private, employer-sponsored insurance and its taxing powers to assure coverage for those with too slender a connection with the workforce.

**Catholic Health Association Plan**

Basic health care should be viewed not as a commodity but as a fundamental right.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Catholic Health Association Plan**

Every human life has intrinsic worth and should not be ranked as more or less important than any other.

**Catholic Health Association Plan**

To assure decent health care for the poor and uninsured, create a health care system in which their fate is linked to that of the average American.

**McDermott/Wellstone Plan**

Achieve universal coverage through a single payer system.

## EXPAND EMPLOYER-SPONSORED INSURANCE

**11. REQUIRE ALL EMPLOYERS TO PROVIDE BASIC HEALTH INSURANCE AS A JOB BENEFIT OR PAY AN EQUIVALENT TAX TO ENROLL EMPLOYEES IN A PUBLIC PLAN ("PLAY OR PAY").**



**American Nurses Association Plan**

Achieve universal coverage for a federally-defined minimum benefits package by requiring employment-based health insurance (or an equivalent tax payment by the employer) and covering the rest of the population with a public health insurance program.

**American Association of Retired Persons  
Plan**

Employers should pay a health care payroll tax unless they opt out by providing a federally-defined comprehensive health benefits package of private insurance to their employees.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**American College of Physicians Plan**

Employers must "play or pay," but the private insurance must be designed so it will generally be cheaper for an employer to play (provide private insurance) than to pay the tax to enroll employees in the public plan.

**Aaron Plan**

The federal government should mandate that employers either sponsor coverage for all workers employed at least twenty-five hours a week, or pay a tax equal to roughly 9 percent of total payroll.

### OPPOSING CONCEPT

**President Bush's Plan**

The "play or pay" approach would hurt small businesses, increase costs for government, force employers to reduce wages or cut employees, and eventually cascade into a form of national health insurance.

**12. REQUIRE ALL EMPLOYERS TO PROVIDE  
BASIC HEALTH INSURANCE AS A JOB  
BENEFIT ("PLAY").**



**Hawaii Plan**

Mandated employer-sponsored health insurance covering a basic benefits package is the practical foundation for universal health insurance, because it leaves a manageable gap to be filled between Medicaid and private insurance.

**Health Insurance Association  
of America Plan**

To achieve universal health insurance coverage, have all employers sponsor health insurance for their employees, publicly fund care for the poor, and require all others to purchase their own coverage.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**American Hospital Association Plan**

Universal coverage should be gradually achieved by requiring employment-based health insurance and consolidating and enlarging the Medicaid and Medicare programs.

**OPPOSING CONCEPTS**

**Reinhardt Plan**

Employers should not be required to provide health insurance for employees, because the cost of such a mandate is simply shifted to customers (in the form of higher prices), to employees (in the form of lower wages or reductions in other fringe benefits) or, least likely, to owners (in the form of lower profits).

**Reinhardt Plan**

All health care dollars are ultimately drawn from the budgets of individual households.

**MAKE LIMITED  
MEDICAID COVERAGE  
MORE WIDELY AVAILABLE**

**13. RATION LIMITED MEDICAID FUNDING  
TO COVER ONLY THOSE HEALTH  
SERVICES THAT ACHIEVE A PUBLICLY-  
DETERMINED THRESHOLD OF COST-  
EFFECTIVENESS.**



**Oregon Plan**

Practical limits on health care resources mean that not every beneficial service can be included in a basic health care package to be assured to everyone.

**Oregon Plan**

Explicit ranking of all health care services to determine which services will be funded and which lower priority services will be denied is an honest and effective way to allocate limited funds for health care of the poor.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Aaron Plan**

Since society has never placed an infinite value on human life, the right to health care services necessarily has limits.

**14. EXPAND MEDICAID TO COVER THOSE  
JUST ABOVE THE POVERTY LEVEL.**



**Conservative Democratic Forum Plan**

Medicaid should be transformed into a new federal program that will pay health plan premiums for those in poverty and provide a premium subsidy on a sliding scale for those with incomes between 100 and 200 percent of the poverty level.

**Stark Plan**

Medicaid should be gradually expanded to provide assistance to individuals with incomes up to 200 percent of the federal poverty level.

**HELP UNDERSERVED AREAS**

**15. RURAL, INNER CITY AND OTHER AREAS  
UNDERSERVED BY THE HEALTH CARE  
SYSTEM NEED EXPANDED GOVERNMENT  
SUBSIDIES FOR FACILITIES AND  
PERSONNEL.**



**President Bush's Plan**

In order to increase the number of doctors and clinics in inner city and rural areas and increase preventive care, funding should be expanded for community health centers, Migrant Health Centers and the National Health Service Corps.

**Conservative Democratic Forum Plan**

Funding to assist rural and other underserved areas should be substantially increased.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**American College of Physicians Plan**

To control costs and provide universal access to medically effective care, enhanced investment is needed in training generalist physicians, in medical research and in management of medical information.

**McDermott/Wellstone Plan**

Greater emphasis should be placed on the delivery of primary and preventive care, especially in underserved areas.

## RESTRUCTURE THE HANDLING OF MALPRACTICE CLAIMS

**16. MEDICAL PRACTICE GUIDELINES,  
ALTERNATIVE DISPUTE RESOLUTION  
AND OTHER MEASURES ARE NEEDED TO  
LESSEN DEFENSIVE MEDICINE AND  
CONTROL THE COST OF HANDLING  
MALPRACTICE CLAIMS.**



### **Hawaii Plan**

Tort reform will help control the cost of defensive medicine.

### **President Bush's Plan**

Incentives that encourage malpractice litigation and defensive medicine can be changed by eliminating joint and several liability, excluding double recovery, promoting alternative dispute resolution, and requiring structured payments for malpractice awards.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

### **Health Insurance Association of America Plan**

Limit defensive medicine through clinical practice guidelines and malpractice litigation reforms.

### **Conservative Democratic Forum Plan**

Reform of the system for handling malpractice claims is needed to reduce the costs of expensive litigation and defensive medicine.

### **President Clinton's Plan**

Medical practice guidelines and other measures are needed to control the cost of dealing with malpractice.

## RESHAPE THE PRIVATE INSURANCE MARKET

### 17. STANDARDIZE AND STREAMLINE HEALTH INSURANCE CLAIMS PROCEDURES.



#### President Bush's Plan

Administrative costs in health care can be reduced through regulatory reforms that streamline the paperwork and by market reforms that allow small businesses to share administrative costs through group purchasing.

#### Health Insurance Association of America Plan

Handle claims with a user-friendly, paperless system.

#### Jackson Hole Group Plan

Standardizing health care insurance practices will improve cost-effectiveness by encouraging competition and creating administrative simplicity.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

#### Conservative Democratic Forum Plan

Federal standards should be developed for health claim forms and electronic transmission of health claims data.

#### President Clinton's Plan

Administrative burdens must be reduced by streamlining procedures.

#### Stark Plan

Uniform claims-handling procedures and electronic networks among providers and payers should be established by the federal government to control the cost of administering the health care system.



**18. ASSURE INDIVIDUALS ACCESS TO HEALTH INSURANCE WITHOUT REGARD TO PREEXISTING CONDITIONS, AND PROHIBIT OR NARROWLY LIMIT THE USE OF EXPERIENCE RATING TO VARY PREMIUMS.**



**Hawaii Plan**

Insurers must insure all employees, regardless of risk, and community rating must be required unless it naturally prevails.

**Oregon Plan**

Require participation by insurance companies in state-run high-risk pools to increase access to coverage for individuals whose preexisting medical conditions would otherwise leave them "uninsurable."

**Heritage Plan**

Assure that individuals can renew health insurance with limited premium increases regardless of health problems.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**American Nurses Association Plan**

Reform private insurance practices to require community rating and eliminate preexisting condition exclusions.

**Health Insurance Association  
of America Plan**

Insurers must issue and renew health care coverage for all, regardless of health, financial or employment status.

**Health Insurance Association  
of America Plan**

Allow limited experience rating of health insurance premiums to preserve cost control incentives, but do not allow drastic premium disparities for demographically similar groups.

**Conservative Democratic Forum Plan**

Health plans should not be allowed to exclude coverage of preexisting conditions or use experience rating.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**President Clinton's Plan**

To widen access to health insurance, new rules must require community rating, open enrollment without regard to preexisting conditions, and availability of a basic benefits package.

**Stark Plan**

To protect wide access to health insurance, new rules for health insurers should eliminate most preexisting condition exclusions and require community rating.

**American College of Physicians Plan**

Insurance plans should be required to offer the same benefits, pay providers according to the same fee schedule, and accept all enrollees, so they would be forced to compete on price charged and on value delivered.

**19. ELIMINATE UNDERPAYMENTS BY PUBLIC HEALTH CARE PROGRAMS THAT SHIFT COST BURDENS ONTO PRIVATELY INSURED PATIENTS.**



**Health Insurance Association  
of America Plan**

Eliminate underpayments by public health care programs that shift cost burdens onto privately insured patients.

**CLARIFY ANTITRUST RULES**

**20. CLARIFY ANTITRUST RULES THAT GOVERN HOW COMPETING HEALTH CARE PROVIDERS MAY SHARE EQUIPMENT, CREATE MANAGED CARE ORGANIZATIONS, OR COLLABORATE IN OTHER WAYS.**



**President Bush's Plan**

Antitrust rules should provide clearer guidelines for health care providers on sharing of medical technology and services, peer review activities, and pooling arrangements.

## USE TAX CREDITS TO COVER MORE PEOPLE

**21. TO BRING THE POOR AND THE LESS AFFLUENT INTO THE HEALTH INSURANCE MARKET, CREATE A FEDERAL TAX CREDIT USABLE FOR HEALTH INSURANCE ONLY WHICH YIELDS A REFUND FOR THE POOR BUT GRADUALLY DIMINISHES AS INCOME RISES.**



### **President Bush's Plan**

The use of tax credits and deductions to assist in the purchase of insurance plans will protect consumer choice and increase awareness of health care costs.

### **Heritage Plan**

Require everyone not covered by a public program to buy basic health insurance and use a tax credit that diminishes as income rises to fund purchases by those with low incomes.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

### **Pauly Plan**

A health care tax credit that diminishes with rising income and that yields a refund for the poor should be substituted for the current tax exclusion of health care benefits.

**22. THOSE WHO DO NOT SECURE PRIVATE INSURANCE SHOULD BE ASSIGNED TO A PUBLIC HEALTH INSURANCE PLAN AND, IF THEY ARE ABOVE THE POVERTY LEVEL, REQUIRED TO PAY A PREMIUM SCALED TO INCOME.**



**Pauly Plan**

To increase awareness of health care costs and to invigorate the market for health insurance, individuals should be required to bargain for and purchase a minimum package of health insurance.

**Pauly Plan**

Since there are limits to an individual's willingness or capacity to obtain health care insurance, the government must provide a mechanism for ensuring basic health insurance coverage for individuals who do not arrange coverage on their own.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Pauly Plan**

People may not recognize or accurately evaluate their own need for health care or health insurance coverage, so the government must establish a minimum required level of coverage.

**Reinhardt Plan**

Those individuals who do not have private insurance should pay a progressive tax to fund insurance to be provided to them by the government, which will bargain for such insurance as a powerful buyer.

**23. TREAT ALL EMPLOYEE HEALTH  
BENEFITS AS TAXABLE COMPENSATION.**



**Heritage Plan**

In order for individuals to become more aware of the costs of health care insurance and to raise money to cover the cost of a tax credit program, employer-paid health insurance benefits should be included in the employee's taxable wages.

**Pauly Plan**

Individuals will shop more aggressively for value in spending their health care insurance dollars, if they see and feel the insurance being purchased with pre-tax dollars.

**Pauly Plan**

Exclusion of health care benefits from income tax distorts employee bargaining behavior in favor of compensation through untaxed health care insurance and gives an inequitable tax break to employees who work for firms with health care benefits as opposed to those who work for firms without such benefits.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Reinhardt Plan**

Keeping the present system in which most people secure health insurance through their work is fine, but employees should be taxed on the value of the insurance.

## FOLLOW MANAGED COMPETITION PRINCIPLES

**24. PRESERVE THE PRIVATE MARKET CORE OF OUR HEALTH CARE SYSTEM AND DEVISE PROCOMPETITIVE MEASURES TO CORRECT ITS SOCIETAL INEQUITIES AND OTHER MARKET FAILURES.**



**Health Insurance Association  
of America Plan**

Use procompetitive public regulations to foster a flexible, pluralistic system of delivering and financing health care.

**Jackson Hole Group Plan**

Preserve the private market core of the American health care system and pair it with appropriate regulation by government to encourage competition among provider organizations and correct market failures.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**President Clinton's Plan**

The government must intervene in the health care system to adjust societal inequities which market forces cannot adequately correct because the free enterprise system does not serve the poor as well as it serves the wealthy.

**25. FORM AN INDEPENDENT NATIONAL COMMISSION TO ESTABLISH A UNIFORM SET OF HEALTH BENEFITS AND TO MONITOR AND IMPROVE THE HEALTH CARE SYSTEM.**



**Health Insurance Association  
of America Plan**

A national commission should establish a basic benefits package and rules of conduct for the health care marketplace.

**American Hospital Association Plan**

An independent federal commission should establish the basic health benefits package and capitation fee guidelines.

**Jackson Hole Group Plan**

To enhance the nation's capacity to get data on and evaluate services provided to patients, a national health board and several private sector boards should be established that would work together to monitor and improve the health care system.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Conservative Democratic Forum Plan**

Form an independent national board to establish a uniform set of effective health benefits and monitor system performance.

**American Association of Retired Persons  
Plan**

The federal government should establish a comprehensive health care benefits package to which all individuals are entitled.

**American College of Physicians Plan**

A national health care commission with representation from patients, providers, employers, insurers, government and other key sectors of society should determine a minimum package of health care benefits.

**26. THE FEDERALLY-DETERMINED MINIMUM BENEFITS PACKAGE MUST INCLUDE A LIFETIME CONTINUUM OF PRIMARY, ACUTE, AND LONG-TERM CARE.**



**American Association of Retired Persons  
Plan**

Health promotion, disease prevention, and acute and long-term care should be coordinated to ensure a continuum of care throughout the lifetime of an individual.

**American Association of Retired Persons  
Plan**

An important element of a long-term care program is assisting families and friends who act as informal caregivers but who themselves need supportive services such as respite care and adult day care.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**American Association of Retired Persons  
Plan**

By setting reasonable levels of cost-sharing by patients and spreading the rest of the cost of long-term care across the entire population through an expanded Medicare program, all individuals can receive long-term care when they need it.

**Catholic Health Association Plan**

The federally-determined minimum benefits package must include a lifetime continuum of primary, acute, and long-term care.

**McDermott/Wellstone Plan**

A comprehensive basic health benefits package should extend to such services as substance abuse treatment, mental health programs and long-term care.



**27. INVOLVE EXPERTS AND THE GENERAL PUBLIC IN DETERMINING AN ACCEPTABLE MINIMUM HEALTH BENEFITS PACKAGE.**



**Oregon Plan**

Broad public participation in the development of a basic health care package allows the shared values of the community to shape the outcome and should give those individuals who will be most affected a chance to express their views.

**Jackson Hole Group Plan**

Since health care resources are limited, the government should, in setting a minimum acceptable standard of health benefits coverage, draw on both expert data and general public commentary.

**28. ENCOURAGE THE FORMATION OF INTEGRATED HEALTH CARE DELIVERY AND FINANCING NETWORKS THAT PROVIDE MANAGED CARE FOR A SET FEE PER INDIVIDUAL, THEN STRUCTURE THE MARKET SO THESE NETWORKS MUST COMPETE AGAINST EACH OTHER.**



**Reinhardt Plan**

On the supply side, the government should encourage the development of managed care options, though a role will remain for more expensive fee-for-service arrangements.

**Health Insurance Association  
of America Plan**

Successful cost containment depends on fostering competition among managed care plans that are accountable to patients and the community.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**American Hospital Association Plan**

Health care networks that offer the needed continuum of health care services should be organized at the community level because communities differ in terms of health care needs, medical practice patterns, regulation of health care providers, and available resources.

**American Hospital Association Plan**

Collaboration of providers within health care networks and competition among networks is a good formula for cost containment.

**Jackson Hole Group Plan**

To provide more cost-effective benefits to society, the government should foster the development of integrated health care delivery and financing systems and structure the market so these systems must compete with each other.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Conservative Democratic Forum Plan**

By using strong tax incentives to encourage insurers and providers to form integrated health care plans, the health care market can be managed more effectively and competition can be fostered.

**American Association of Retired Persons  
Plan**

The growth of managed care plans should be encouraged.

**Shortell Plan**

Health care providers should be clinically accountable for the health care services they deliver and should be financially rewarded for enhancing the health status of the population they serve.

**Catholic Health Association Plan**

State Health Organizations should oversee the shaping of health care resources into competing integrated delivery networks.

**29. PROMOTE HEALTH INSURANCE  
PURCHASING COOPERATIVES TO POOL  
INDIVIDUAL AND SMALL BUSINESS  
BUYING POWER.**



**Oregon Plan**

Promote health insurance purchasing networks to pool individual and small business buying power.

**President Bush's Plan**

The use of health insurance networks to pool buying power recognizes that individual consumers and small businesses are limited in terms of bargaining power and resources.

**Reinhardt Plan**

The federal government should reconfigure the health care system to organize and strengthen the collective bargaining power of consumers on the "demand side" of the health care equation.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Jackson Hole Group Plan**

Since small businesses and individuals, especially the uninsured, have limited expertise and ability to bargain for health insurance coverage, they should have the opportunity to join purchasing cooperatives that will collectively bargain on their behalf for such coverage.

**Conservative Democratic Forum Plan**

Create large regional health insurance purchasing cooperatives to give individuals and small businesses the benefits of greater buying power.

**President Clinton's Plan**

Health insurance purchasing cooperatives must be fostered to pool small business and individual buying power.

**Stark Plan**

Promote health insurance purchasing cooperatives to bargain for managed care plans and increase buying power for individuals and small businesses.

**30. REQUIRE HEALTH CARE PROVIDERS TO DISCLOSE COST AND PERFORMANCE DATA.**



**Hawaii Plan**

Providers must be required to publish cost and performance data so those who purchase health care can bargain intelligently.

**American Hospital Association Plan**

Networks should be accountable to their communities for cost-effectiveness and for maintaining and improving the health status of the community they serve.

**Jackson Hole Group Plan**

The government should require health care providers to make available standardized health outcomes and cost data.

**Hagan Plan**

Providers must be required to disclose cost and performance data to the state-run health care plan.

**31. LIMIT THE INCOME TAX EXCLUSION FOR HEALTH BENEFITS TO THE COST OF BUYING THE FEDERALLY-DETERMINED MINIMUM BENEFITS PACKAGE FROM A LOCAL MANAGED CARE PROVIDER.**



**Hawaii Plan**

To make all parties cost-conscious, specific limits should be set on the value of health insurance benefits which can be excluded from an employee's taxable income.

**Health Insurance Association  
of America Plan**

To promote tax equity and to help fund health care coverage for the poor, any employee health benefits in excess of the basic benefits package should be treated as taxable income to the employee.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Jackson Hole Group Plan**

To achieve greater equity and promote effective bargaining for health insurance, the income tax exemption for individuals' health insurance premiums paid by employers or by the self-employed should be limited to the cost of the minimum benefits package.

**Conservative Democratic Forum Plan**

Employers should be allowed to deduct basic health plan costs, but not the excess costs of policies which cover more than the basic benefits package.

**Conservative Democratic Forum Plan**

All individuals, including the self-employed, should be allowed to exclude from taxable income 100 percent of the cost of a basic health benefits package.

**32. ALLOW PAYMENTS TO HEALTH PLANS TO QUALIFY FOR FAVORABLE TAX TREATMENT ONLY IF THE PLANS COMPLY WITH THE MANAGED COMPETITION RULES.**



**Conservative Democratic Forum Plan**

To keep tax-favored status, health plans must offer the standard benefits package, comply with insurance reforms and disclose information on medical outcomes, cost-effectiveness and consumer satisfaction.

## CONTROL COSTS WITH GLOBAL BUDGETS OR EXPENDITURE TARGETS

**33. USE GLOBAL BUDGETS OR EXPENDITURE TARGETS AT THE NATIONAL AND STATE LEVELS TO CONTROL THE GROWTH OF HEALTH CARE COSTS.**



**American Hospital Association Plan**

When health care providers are held publicly accountable for health outcomes and financially responsible for maintaining a predetermined budget, there are proper incentives to maintain patient health and keep costs to a minimum.

**American Association of Retired Persons Plan**

Cost containment can be achieved by setting expenditure targets at the national and state level and by establishing uniform reimbursement rates for both the new Medicare system and private insurers.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**President Clinton's Plan**

Use of global budgets at the national and state levels set by a national health care board is necessary to control growth of health care costs.

**Stark Plan**

A global health care budget for the nation operating in conjunction with a federal rate-setting system for all health care services is necessary to control health care costs.

**Stark Plan**

An independent agency established by the federal government should set prices for all health care services.

**Shortell Plan**

Areawide health care budgets and a controlled price for a basic benefits package are necessary measures for cost-effective management of the health care system.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**American College of Physicians Plan**

Global budgeting will promote cooperation and compel providers and payers to explicitly negotiate how to meet each community's needs with limited dollars - a function largely missing in an open-ended, fee-for-service system that rewards excessive care.

**American College of Physicians Plan**

Exceeding budgets will sometimes be justified, since global budgeting is a device to introduce fiscal discipline and to evaluate whether expenditures reflect expected costs, not a mechanism to cut off necessary health care.

**Aaron Plan**

Efficient allocation of health care resources is better attained through a global budget than through controls on price per unit of service, because price limits provide no incentive to deny low-benefit care.

**Catholic Health Association Plan**

To control health care costs, use national expenditure caps and risk-adjusted capitated payments to competing integrated health plans.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Hagan Plan**

Requiring institutional providers to negotiate a single annual budget will create appropriate incentives to control cost.

**McDermott/Wellstone Plan**

Contain health care costs through national, state and institutional budgets, negotiated provider fee schedules, and limitations on prescription drug prices.

**McDermott/Wellstone Plan**

A state's share of the national health budget should be based on population, cost of living, proportion of rural or medically underserved areas, and any special conditions affecting health status.

**OPPOSING CONCEPTS**

**Hawaii Plan**

A national health care budget and federal price controls are unwieldy, unnecessary and politically unappealing.

[CONTINUED]

[CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE]

**Heritage Plan**

Health care costs are better controlled through consumer choice than through price controls.

**Jackson Hole Group Plan**

Top down price controls in the form of global budgets are impractical and would undermine an effort to achieve cost control through managed competition.

**34. ESTABLISH HEALTH PROMOTION AND ACCOUNTABILITY REGIONS TO SET BUDGETS, ASSESS NEEDS, AND MANAGE THE HEALTH CARE SYSTEM IN A WAY THAT IS RESPONSIVE TO LOCAL REALITIES.**



**Shortell Plan**

To manage the health care system in a way that is responsive to local realities, states should charter Health Promotion and Accountability Regions (HPARs), that is, regional partnerships among health care system participants.

**Shortell Plan**

An epidemiological assessment of an HPAR's population will be an important step in determining the health care needs, basic benefits package, and overall health care budget of the region.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Shortell Plan**

HPARs may themselves need backup insurance to cover underestimates of health care use caused by natural disasters or other unexpected events.

**Catholic Health Association Plan**

Each State Health Organization should serve an appropriate region, which could be all or part of a state, or a metropolitan region in more than one state.



## BROADEN MEDICARE TO ACHIEVE UNIVERSAL COVERAGE

**35. ACHIEVE UNIVERSAL HEALTH CARE  
COVERAGE BY EXPANDING MEDICARE  
AND ABOLISHING MEDICAID.**



**American Association of Retired Persons  
Plan**

The Medicaid program should be abolished and the Medicare program should be expanded and strengthened to ensure universal health care access for all individuals, regardless of age, income or employment status.

## ACHIEVE EQUITY AND EFFICIENCY WITH A SINGLE PAYER SYSTEM

**36. USE A SINGLE NATIONAL PAYER FOR THE  
HEALTH CARE SYSTEM TO CONTROL  
COSTS, LIMIT UNNECESSARY  
TREATMENT, AND BARGAIN FOR GOOD  
ACCESS TO CARE FOR THE  
UNDERSERVED.**



**Aaron Plan**

Since market competition does not function well in small communities or inner city urban areas with a limited number of health care providers, a single payer system supervised by regional agents is needed to monitor patterns of care and bargain for good health care access even in underserved areas.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Aaron Plan**

A wholly public plan is not obtainable because Congress would be unwilling to shift current private health care expenditures and disbursements to public budgets and to displace current health care arrangements for most Americans.

**Aaron Plan**

Although federal action is necessary to set a floor under the provision of insurance coverage and set global budgets, states should act as financial agents to shape health care spending and health care benefits to meet local needs.

**Aaron Plan**

Global budgeting requires that control over health care spending be concentrated in one or a few hands.

**Catholic Health Association Plan**

Fragmentation in the sources of health care funding fosters a similar fragmentation of the delivery system.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**Hagan Plan**

Instead of using a patchwork system of premiums, deductibles, copayments, and out-of-pocket expenditures to finance health care, a financing structure which uses payroll and excise taxes will distribute costs more efficiently.

**Hagan Plan**

The most direct route to universal coverage and acceptable cost control is through a state-run, single-payer health care insurance system.

**Hagan Plan**

A single payer mechanism will control health care cost inflation and unnecessary medical treatment more effectively than a multiple payer system, because a single payer can conduct systemic analysis and limit payments to providers.

**McDermott/Wellstone Plan**

A single payer system should be administered by the states under the direction of a national health board.

CONTINUED

CONTINUED FROM PREVIOUS PAGE

**McDermott/Wellstone Plan**

A single payer national health system which replaces most private health insurance, Medicare and Medicaid will be more efficient than the current multiple payer system.

**McDermott/Wellstone Plan**

A state-based single payer program will simplify and streamline the health care system and lower administrative waste.

**OPPOSING CONCEPTS**

**President Bush's Plan**

Because health care services would have to be rationed and prices controlled, a government-run single payer system would destroy diversity and flexibility in the financing, organization, and delivery of care.

**Pauly Plan**

Individuals with varying preferences about health care and insurance will be dissatisfied with a single payer, government-run system, because their range of choice of health care services and insurance coverage will be sharply reduced.