



CSU  
College of Law Library

Cleveland State University  
**EngagedScholarship@CSU**

---

[All Articles](#)

[Newspaper Coverage](#)

---

11-22-1954

## 54/11/22 Dr. Sam's 6 Stories Fall Into Tangle

Cleveland News

Follow this and additional works at: [https://engagedscholarship.csuohio.edu/newspaper\\_coverage](https://engagedscholarship.csuohio.edu/newspaper_coverage)

[How does access to this work benefit you? Let us know!](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Cleveland News, "54/11/22 Dr. Sam's 6 Stories Fall Into Tangle" (1954). *All Articles*. 426.

[https://engagedscholarship.csuohio.edu/newspaper\\_coverage/426](https://engagedscholarship.csuohio.edu/newspaper_coverage/426)

This Book is brought to you for free and open access  
by the Newspaper Coverage at  
EngagedScholarship@CSU. It has been accepted for  
inclusion in All Articles by an authorized administrator  
of EngagedScholarship@CSU. For more information,  
please contact [library.es@csuohio.edu](mailto:library.es@csuohio.edu).



# Dr. Sam's 6 Stories Fall Into Tangle

(Editor's Note: Dorothy Kilgallen is in Cleveland covering the Sheppard trial for the New York Journal-American. A newspaperwoman of note, she is also guesser of occupations on the CBS television show, "What's My Line.")

BY DOROTHY KILGALLEN

With the state about ready to hit the peak of its case, it would appear that if Dr. Sam Sheppard

is found guilty of his wife's murder it will be because he fashioned the noose himself.

If the noose hanging above the handsome young osteopath's head ever drops over his neck, it will be fashioned from a tangled skein of his own weaving.

The Six Stories of Dr. Sam—his personal versions of what happened on the night his wife was bludgeoned to death in her bed—have set before the jury such a bouillabaise of bewildering facts that it will be a human



DOROTHY  
KILGALLEN

and legal miracle if the seven men and five women can face the hour of decision with clear heads.

No one who has been in the courtroom every day and heard every witness could disagree.

This jury has a job to do that would make Ellery Queen's head spin. Perhaps that is why the law calls ordinary citizens, not crime experts, to sit in judgment. Perhaps only 12 plain, simple, average persons with uncomplicated minds and no experience in violence could solve this extravagantly complicated, curiously violent puzzle.

In the five weeks of the seemingly interminable trial, 10 witnesses have been heard.

Three of them have testified they talked to Dr. Sheppard or interviewed him from a position of authority, about the events of  
**Continued on Page 11, Column 3**

# Dr. Sam's Six Stories Spin Tangled Skein

Continued From Page 1.

the night of July 3 and the morning of July 4, during which his wife was thoroughly killed and he was somewhat superficially injured.

There is the story he told Mayor Houk at about 6 o'clock on the morning of the fatal holiday. Mayor Houk was the first person on the scene—summoned by the doctor himself.

There is the story of Dr. Samuel R. Gerber, the county coroner. He talked to Dr. Sheppard at Bay View Hospital on July 4.

There are two stories told to Homicide Detectives Robert Schottke and Patrick Gareau—one at 11 a. m. on the day of the crime, one at 3 p. m.

There is a fifth version related to the police and prosecuting attorneys at the sheriff's office on July 10, typed on nine pages and signed by Dr. Sheppard.

There is still another on the pages of the report of the July 22 coroner's inquest at which Dr. Sheppard testified under oath for five and a half hours.

No two are alike.

On some points, some impor-

tant points, the versions differ greatly.

Yet, only one witness—Mayor Houk—has testified that Dr. Sam appeared "dazed."

"Normal" is the word used by Dr. Gerber to describe how the defendant looked in the hospital the first day. "Normal" and "unemotional" were used by Detective Schottke.

Dr. Sam never lost his temper, even when these strangers asked him if he had killed his wife.

He did not appear indignant or angry when they asked if his wife had lovers, if he was unfaithful, if he was carrying on with a girl from his family's hospital.

He even brought himself to inform them, in his July 10 typed and signed statement, that the slain Marilyn had had at "least three po-

tential lovers" who might have killed her.

The jury has been told that there were two "intruders" encountered by the bereaved husband on the tragic night.

They have been told there was one.

Dr. Sheppard said he was "clobbered" when he reached the top of the stairs on his way to his screaming wife.

In a later version he eliminated the "clobbering" in favor of "It was a judo punch."

(The State will contend that Dr. Sheppard changed his story of the "clobbering" and substituted the judo punch when he realized it would have been difficult for the injuries of which he complained to have been inflicted by a fist on the back of his neck.)

In one version Dr. Sheppard does not mention going into the bedroom to look at his wife be-

fore hearing the noise that caused him to run downstairs again and pursue the intruder out the door to the lake.

In another version he mentions looking at her and getting "the impression" that she was "gone."

In a third version he talks of looking at her before pursuing the prowler and looking at her again and taking her pulse at the neck after he had been knocked unconscious for the second time.

In one of the versions he says he does not know how many times he may have wandered in and out of the bedroom in a "disorientated" state of mind.

The question of the blood on his own wristwatch remains an unanswered question, and no one has suggested how it can be answered.

There was blood smeared across the face, blood on the extension band, and blood in the links between the band and the watch.

When asked about this, Dr. Sheppard theorized: "It must have gotten on the watch when I bent over to take her pulse."

But if so much blood got on the watch, it is hard to understand why some did not get on his skin at the arm or hand.

There was no blood on his skin the next morning and he said he had not washed his hands.

Detective Shottke asked the question: "How do you account for the watch being found in this bag?" (It was discovered, with his ring and key chain in a green bag tossed in the underbrush outside the house).

Dr. Sam replied: "It must have been taken off when I

was unconscious."

Since he was knocked unconscious the first time before ever reaching his wife's side, it could not have been removed then, for there was no blood on him.

## ANOTHER IDEA

If it was removed the second time he was knocked out, on the beach, then the murderer took it off his wrist only to insert it into a green cloth bag with the rest of the jewelry, mount 52 steps back to the Sheppard lawn, and throw the bag down into the bushes.

One other possibility remains: the blood on the

watch could have come from blood on the murderer's hands.

But the murderer did not get blood on anything else he touched, if he was the one who ransacked two desks, put some papers and drawers on the floor, overturned the doctor's bag in the hall and unlocked the door to the lake side of the house.

And those are only a handful of the clues and crossed-up clues.

If this jury can unravel the twisted skeins and arrive at a verdict, it deserves to go down as the Jury of the Year.

Copyright King Features, 1954.